

**GRADUATE COUNCIL
MARCH 9, 2006, 1:30 P.M.
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, GILMOUR HALL 111**

PRESENT: Dean F.L. Hall (Chair), Dr. N. Agarwal, Mr. L. Ariano, Dr. M. Boda, Dr. G. Bone, Dean D. Capson, Dr. L. Chan, Ms. K. Espiritu, Ms. E. Giles, Dean D. Goellnicht, Dr. P. Guo, Dr. C. Ingram, Mr. S. Kleinknecht, Ms. K. Kowalska, Mr. Y. Li, Dr. G. Luke, Mr. S. Luyk, Dr. G. Moyal, Dr. R. O'Brien, Dr. D. Pawluch, Dr. S. Porter, Dean C. Richards, Mr. J. Scime (Secretary), Dr. C. Swartz, Dr. M. Stein, Dr. G. Steiner, Dr. R. Viveros-Aguilera, Mrs. M. Espiritu (Recording Secretary)

BY INVITATION: Dr. M. Black, Ms. A. Thyret-Kidd

REGRETS: Dean P. Bates, Dr. K. Bennett, Dr. M. Head, Ms. T. Kuzmenko, Dr. J-P Xu

I. MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting of February 2, 2006 were approved on a motion by Dr. Moyal, seconded by Dean Richards.

II. BUSINESS ARISING

There was no business arising from the minutes.

III. DEAN'S REPORT

Dean Hall discussed the four tables containing various information which he thought will be of interest to members of Graduate Council: (a) Competitive Awards as Percent of Enrolment; (b) Academic Results for Students Entering Doctoral Study on a Full-Time Basis During the Period September 1994-August 1999 (Results as of August 31, 2005); (c) Academic Results for Students Entering Master's Study on a Full-Time Basis During the Period September 1999-August 2002 (Results as of August 31, 2005); and (d) Percentage of Graduate Students Completed In-Time in 2004-2005 Academic Year. Referring to Table (a), Dean Hall pointed out that the Department of Anthropology has attained 75% in scholarship awards in the first four years while the Department of Sociology has increased to 39%. However, Dean Hall said the figures for the departments in the Faculty of Engineering show that they need to be more competitive in terms of acquiring scholarship awards.

In Table (b), Dean Hall remarked that the figures (5.7) in the *Median Years to Complete* for both the departments of Biochemistry and Anthropology are not good. Dr O'Brien commented that there are situations in which the four-year duration is not sufficient, e.g., a student doing fieldwork in another country may need several months to learn another language in addition to meeting program requirements. This situation is reasonable, Dean Hall said, but McMaster ends up providing free service to those students who take longer than four years to complete because the province does not fund the University for students who take longer to finish.

Dean Hall pointed out that Table (c) shows an 88% success rate in the Master's program. Table (c) includes the figures for students transferring to Ph.D. without completing the Master's program. Dean Hall said this scenario occurs mostly in the faculties of Engineering and Science. Dean Hall explained that Table (d) deals with the number of students who complete in- time either within four years at the Ph.D. or within one year or two years of the Master's program. Dr. Bone commented that perhaps the four-year limit is no longer realistic because Ph.D. programs are becoming more challenging.

Referring to Table (a), Dean Richards commented that the figures provided for the Faculty of Health Sciences could change if other scholarship awards are included on the list. According to Dean Hall, the data provided in Table (a) are taken from the University payroll, and information regarding awards directly bestowed to students is not included in the table. Mr. Scime commented that there should be some criteria in place to help determine which awards should be on the list.

Dean Hall then discussed the various stages of approval for the following programs:

- 1) On March 3, 2006, two new graduate programs were approved by OCGS: M.Sc./Ph.D. in Chemical Biology and M.Eng./M.A.Sc./M.Sc./Ph.D. in Computational Engineering and Science
- 2) The University Senate approved the following at its recent meeting: Combined M.D./Ph.D program, and closure of the M.A. in Music Criticism.

Dean Hall said the following new programs have initiated the approval process: Ph.D. in Health Policy, M.Sc. in Environment and Health, M.Sc./Ph.D. Neuroscience, and M.Sc./Ph.D. Linguistics.

As well, Dean Hall reminded members of the upcoming Graduate Students Recognition Day to be held on March 20, 2006.

IV. AD HOC COMMITTEE FOR DIVINITY COLLEGE SUBMISSIONS

Dean Hall explained the proposal to create an ad hoc committee to discuss the submissions from Divinity College. The ad hoc committee will consist of the faculty members from the Joint Faculties of Humanities and Social Sciences Graduate Curriculum and Policy Committee and the two Graduate Council members from Divinity College. The ad hoc committee will report to Graduate Council. Dean Hall explained that the formation of the ad hoc committee will not change the by-laws of the Joint Faculties of Humanities and Social Sciences Graduate Curriculum and Policy Committee, and Divinity College will not become part of the Joint Faculties of Humanities and Social Sciences Graduate Curriculum and Policy Committee.

Dean Capson moved, and Dean Goellnicht seconded,

“that Graduate Council approve the creation and member composition of the Ad Hoc

Committee for Divinity College submissions.”

The motion was carried.

V. ACADEMIC INTEGRITY REGARDING THESIS DRAFTS

Dean Hall explained that a proposal concerning the development of some principles and language for the treatment of plagiarism in drafts of a graduate student’s thesis was presented to the Graduate Council Executive Committee at its February 2, 2006 meeting. The results of the discussion as outlined in the document were also presented at the meeting of the Committee on Academic Integrity on February 28, 2006. Dean Hall introduced Ms. Andrea Thyret-Kidd, the Academic Integrity Officer, and said that Ms. Thyret-Kidd will respond to members’ questions concerning the proposal. Dean Hall then reviewed the document and asked for comments. The general comment was that there should be a clear definition of what the term “draft” means, e.g., preliminary draft, official draft, etc. To clarify the issue, Dean Richards suggested adding the phrase, “a draft that is actually submitted for review to the supervisor.” Ms. Thyret-Kidd said the Committee on Academic Integrity is aware that all terms stipulated in the proposal should be defined clearly, but since the committee has only recently started reviewing the issue of thesis drafts, they have not yet gone any further in defining the terms. Ms. Thyret-Kidd then referred to the document that was circulated, *Appendix 4 - General Penalty Guidelines* (a section in the Academic Integrity Policy); she discussed the section pertaining to penalties for graduate students committing plagiarism in their academic work. Dean Goellnicht reminded Ms. Thyret-Kidd that McMaster should ensure its students are not treated differently from graduates of other universities.

Dr. Luke moved, and Dr. Ingram seconded,

“that Graduate Council approve the proposed principles and procedures regarding the treatment of plagiarism in drafts of a graduate student’s thesis, as outlined in the document.”

The motion was carried.

VI. SECTION 4.2 OF THE GRADUATE CALENDAR

Dean Hall explained that the first two paragraphs of Section 4.2 of the calendar are being revised in order to incorporate the OCGS requirement regarding 600-level courses.

Dr. Swartz moved, and Dean Richards seconded,

“that Graduate Council approve the proposed revision to Section 4.2 of the graduate calendar, as set out in the document.”

The motion was carried.

VII. MASTER OF NURSING - PRIMARY HEALTH CARE NURSE PRACTITIONER (MN/NP) AND GRADUATE DIPLOMA

Dean Richards presented the proposed program and he introduced Dr. Margaret Black, who was present to respond to questions from the Council. Dean Richards explained that the proposed Master's program would prepare primary health-care nurse practitioners to develop new approaches in delivering primary health care and to critically appraise the research literature and apply these findings to practice. Dr. Ingram remarked that the implementation of this program will be coordinated by 10 Ontario universities and the Council of Ontario Universities Programs in Nursing. She added that there is strong provincial, national, and international support for the advanced practice in nursing to be at a Master's level. Referring to the document, Dean Richards discussed at length the degree, diploma, and entrance requirements of the proposal. The unique feature of the proposed program is that the core graduate courses will be offered in conjunction with the Master of Science in Rehabilitation Science, which is available on-line by distance education at McMaster and the University of British Columbia. In the MN/NP program, students with BScN degrees will be required to take three core graduate courses, prepare a scholarly paper, and take the seven NP courses. Students with Master's degrees will enter the NP Consortium course component; a Graduate Diploma will be granted to them upon completion of the courses. The Master's program expects to admit 15 students annually; while the Graduate Diploma will accept no more than two students per year. Furthermore, Dean Richards said that the Nursing program is currently undergoing OCGS review and the department would like to include this proposal in the review.

Mr. Scime noted that the completion time for the proposed Master's program is three years; he inquired about the financial support for the students since Master's programs are only funded for two years. Dean Richards explained that there is a commitment from other government agencies to fund this program, but he is not yet aware as to what level of funding is being proposed. That is why, Dean Richards said, Graduate Council is only asked to approve the program in principle because the financial aspect still requires clarification.

Dean Richards moved, and Dr. Ingram seconded,

“that Graduate Council approve in principle, pending clarification of the funding to the program, the proposed Master of Nursing - Primary Health Care Nurse Practitioner (MN/NP) and Graduate Diploma, as outlined in the document.”

The motion was carried.

VIII. GRADUATE CALENDAR COPIES: HARD COPY OR ELECTRONIC ONLY

Dean Hall asked members' comments concerning the distribution of the graduate calendar—that is, whether they prefer hard copies or an electronic version only. Some members still prefer hard copies and they suggested printing a limited number of copies. Mr. Scime explained that it becomes more expensive per copy if a small number is printed. Ms. Giles suggested providing copies of the calendar on CDs; she said this method will also save on postage cost. In response

to Dean Hall, Mr. Ariano said the distribution of the undergraduate calendar is currently limited to faculty members and department office staff, and that students who prefer hard copies of the calendar can buy them at the bookstore. The calendar is not used as a tool for promoting undergraduate programs—there are separate publication materials for this purpose; a CD version of the calendar is also available; and the calendar is accessible as well on the website. With these options, the printing of the undergraduate calendar was significantly reduced to 12,000 copies. Dr. Bone commented that the course listings in the graduate calendar are not effective because many of the courses listed are not even offered. Dean Hall thanked the members for their comments and asked them to liaise with Mr. Scime if they have other suggestions on this issue.

IX. TREATMENT OF EUROPEAN THREE-YEAR BACHELOR DEGREES

Dean Hall referred to the document outlining the article from the *Chronicle of Higher Education* published on November 7, 2005. The article is about the views of American graduate schools and universities concerning the new three-year bachelor's degrees from the European education system. Dean Hall then asked for members' comments on what McMaster should do with regards to the issue. Dean Hall noted that McMaster has occasionally admitted students with three-year bachelor's degrees from the U.K. After a brief discussion, Dean Hall said he will prepare a calendar copy addressing this issue.

X. GRADUATE SCHOLARSHIPS

Mr. Scime presented the following graduate scholarships for approval by Graduate Council:

- a) The Bill Carment Memorial Scholarship in Social Development
- b) MBA Entrance Scholarships
- c) Raynsford-Eatock Graduate Travel Bursary in Greek Studies

The description for the Bill Carment Memorial Scholarship had a minor revision: "his research training" was replaced with "his/her research training."

Dr. Steiner commented that the preference of awarding the MBA Entrance Scholarships to students in the MBA Co-op program is not logical. In his opinion, co-op students have a lesser need of financial support (as opposed to full-time MBA students) because they have employment work every second term. Mr. Scime said the donors have the right to choose the program to which they donate their money.

Dean Goellnicht moved, and Dr. Bone seconded,

“that Graduate Council approve the three scholarships mentioned above (subject to the minor revision for the Bill Carment Memorial Scholarship).”

The motion was carried.

XI. OTHER BUSINESS

Australian Report

Dean Hall delivered a presentation concerning Ph.D completion rates and time to completion. Dean Hall explained that the presentation is based on a paper that he co-authored with two faculty members from the University of Melbourne and the University of Washington. Dean Hall will present this paper in Australia in mid-April 2006. He said the three universities that were used in the comparison study were McMaster, Melbourne and Duke. He explained that the interest in comparing doctoral programs among different countries is growing due to the increased flow of international students and their interest in acquiring information on universities of their choice. Dean Hall further said that the increase in comparison of doctoral programs among different countries is also due to the new European three-year bachelor's degree, which will have an impact on universities worldwide.

Dean Hall then discussed at length the indicators (Time to Degree and Completion Rates) that were used for the comparison, as well as the data for the analysis. At the conclusion of his presentation, Dean Hall said the completion rates and times to completion for the three universities differ for several reasons: (a) the nature of the undergraduate program; (b) the structure of the Ph.D. program; (c) continuous registration; (d) definition of full-time study; (e) percent of part-time students; and (f) employment prospects of graduate students.

Dean Hall explained that there are some activities at the University of Melbourne that he wants to adopt at McMaster, such as: workshops for supervisors, orientation sessions for new graduate students, academic skills sessions, etc. He added that he is discussing these activities with the Centre for Leadership and Learning and the University library. Both CLL and the library have expressed interest in developing and conducting workshops and sessions for current and incoming graduate students.

There was no other business and the meeting adjourned at 3:25 p.m.