## **Eighteenth-Century Fiction**

Volume 17 | Issue 1 Article 8

10-31-2004

Review of: Susan C. Greenfiled, Mothering Daughters: Novels and the Politics of Family Romance, Frances Burney to Jane Austen

Deborah D. Rogers

## Recommended Citation

Rogers, Deborah D. (2004) "Review of: Susan C. Greenfiled, Mothering Daughters: Novels and the Politics of Family Romance, Frances Burney to Jane Austen," Eighteenth-Century Fiction: Vol. 17: Iss. 1, Article 8.

Available at: http://digitalcommons.mcmaster.ca/ecf/vol17/iss1/8

 $Copyright @2013 \ by \ Eighteenth-Century \ Fiction, McMaster \ University. \ This \ Article \ is \ brought to you \ by \ Digital Commons@McMaster. \ It has been accepted for inclusion in Eighteenth-Century Fiction by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons@McMaster. For more information, please contact <math>scom@mcmaster.ca.$ 

Review of: Susan C. Greenfiled, Mothering Daughters: Novels and the Politics of Family Romance, Frances Burney to Jane Austen

Rogers: Book review

## 132 EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY FICTION 17:1

to be definite and limited, but evidence from the South Seas brought back by Philibert Commerson and later by Darwin bore out the intuitions of Monboddo, who had foretold that the metamorphosis of species would be confirmed by austral discoveries. In a book with that very title, Restif de la Bretonne celebrated the community of humans and orangutans.

It seems to be a fundamental point of difference between the giants of the Enlightenment whether humans and the human character could be changed by circumstances of climate, geography, transplantion, or solitude, and whether speciation was a perpetual process or the basic outlines of humans and all other species were settled and immutable. Montesquieu, Monboddo, Raynal, and Diderot stand on one side; Hume, Thomas Jefferson, de Sade, and Linnaeus on the other. Douthwaite is to be praised for setting this difference in such a broad spectrum of contexts, so well detailed and so full of hints for further reading. The narrative she offers, however, is necessarily circular, from Gulliver's Yahoos to Frankenstein's monster. Once it became possible for enlightened human beings to consider their capacity for change, and the degree that change might be controlled by themselves, the myth of original innocence seems to mock, and be mocked by, the dream of perfectible humanity. It is perhaps not surprising that the century should witness the rise of theriophily, now known as animal rights, a movement in favour of sympathy with animals that seems coincident with the most profound doubts about the humanity of humans.

Jonathan Lamb Vanderbilt University

Susan C. Greenfield. *Mothering Daughters: Novels and the Politics of Family Romance, Frances Burney to Jane Austen.* Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2002. 227pp. US\$34.95. ISBN 0-8143-2992-6.

The essays that made up Susan Greenfield's (co-edited) *Inventing Maternity* (1999) demonstrated the malleability of the sentimental, devoted maternal figure. Besides convincing us that one of our richest cultural symbols, the maternal body, is perpetually reinvented, this analysis influentially maintained that motherhood remains a contested site of political discourse.

Addressing the representation of the mother-daughter bond in early novels, the volume under discussion here is a natural extension of this argument. Again Greenfield proceeds from the assumption—which has become codified, partially owing to her own earlier work—that the maternal body is culturally constructed for political purposes. *Mothering Daughters* 

133

furthers her argument against a static, conservative model of maternity. This study is concerned with the flexible and ambiguous representation of maternity, with the emergence of early modern constructions of motherhood and the gendered body, and with the way in which the mother-daughter plot in women's novels affected modern motherhood. To this end, Greenfield considers the ideological implications of women's representations of mother-daughter relationships in terms of a variety of issues such as gender, class, sexuality, pregnancy, homoerotic and incestuous desire, maternal breast-feeding, and legal, racial, and colonial discourse.

Greenfield connects the development of the novel with the development of the nuclear family, focusing on the idealization of motherhood. She provides a historical, political and cultural context for the mother-daughter bond in the fiction of late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century women. From a feminist psychoanalytic approach that is heavily influenced by Freud, Kristeva, and Lacan, Greenfield analyses Frances Burney's Evelina (1778), Ann Radcliffe's The Italian (1797), Mary Wollstonecraft's The Wrongs of Woman; or, Maria (1798), Maria Edgeworth's Belinda (1801), Amelia Alderson Opie's Adeline Mowbray, or The Mother and Daughter (1804), and Jane Austen's Emma (1816). In these works, which feature missing mothers and suffering daughters, maternal absence emphasizes the importance of motherhood and the mother-daughter bond: "In novel after novel, the mother's absence highlights her indispensability; the daughter's pain bears witness to her love" (13).

Besides documenting the contribution of the mother-daughter plot to the development of the novel and to the construction of modern maternal ideals, Greenfield makes claims for its contribution to psychoanalytic theory. Although Marianne Hirsch earlier took on psychoanalytic theory directly in *The Mother/Daughter Plot* (1989), she deals with Austen and later novelists, while Toni Bowers's novelists in *The Politics of Motherhood* (1996) predate Greenfield's, as do those of Felicity Nussbaum, whose *Torrid Zones* (1995) also emphasizes other cultural texts. Greenfield both incorporates and responds to these analyses of women's novelization of maternal authority. Her own innovative and exciting work legitimately takes its place among these landmark studies.

Although the connection among the novel, maternal absence, and the nuclear family may, by now, be familiar, *Mothering Daughters* attempts to identify the role that the newly emerging women's novel played in constructing modern maternity. If she never claims that early women's fiction influenced Freud, Greenfield boldly relates the family romance popularized in the early novel to the development and acceptance of psychoanalytic theory. She concludes that models of kinship in women's novels helped construct the pre-Oedipal mother-infant bond (which depends on assumptions about maternal significance) that is at the heart of psychoanalytic theory. That is, in their early fiction, women anticipated and helped create psychoanalytic theory. This cutting-edge argument is as stunning as it is controversial. However fascinating Greenfield's ideas about the pre-Oedipal

Rogers: Book review

## 134 EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY FICTION 17:1

period are, she necessarily butts heads with psychoanalytic theorists who find Freud problematic. Greenfield is, however, fully aware of critics (such as Jane Gallop) who insist on separating maternal theory from the assumptions of psychoanalysis. Greenfield also defends herself from anticipated criticism for using psychoanalysis to interpret pre-Freudian fiction.

If some of Greenfield's readings are provocative, they are always responsible and grounded. For example, her analysis of mother-daughter eroticism in *The Italian* is surprisingly convincing. Here she argues that Radcliffe depicts homoerotic incest not only as normal and as less catastrophic than heterosexual incest but also as a source of security within the family. Greenfield's emphasis on the ideological and psychological complexity of the novels she discusses makes this book a remarkable and groundbreaking contribution to cultural studies of motherhood and to literary history. Her dazzling analysis of maternal discourse contributes to our understanding not only of the rise of the novel but also of psychoanalytic theory.

Deborah D. Rogers University of Maine

Sophie Cottin. *Claire d'Albe (The Original French Text)*, ed. Margaret Cohen. New York: Modern Language Association of America, 2002. xxviii+158pp. US\$9.95. ISBN 0-87352-925-1.

Sophie Cottin. *Claire d'Albe (An English Translation)*, trans. Margaret Cohen. New York: Modern Language Association of America, 2002. xxxiii+155pp. US\$9.95. ISBN 0-87352-926-X.

Michael J. Call. *Infertility and the Novels of Sophie Cottin*. Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2002; London: Associated University Presses, 2002. 167pp. US\$35. ISBN 0874138078.

Many of the texts republished by the MLA since 1993 are by the forgotten women writers of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century France. They were "buried" more whole-heartedly than in the United States and Britain. For, patriarchal though these societies were, they were less oppressive than the France that enshrined misogyny in its Napoleonic Civil Code and that, despite its influential 1970s women's movement, still lags in its promotion of women's rights. And yet, as is clear in the case of the author Sophie Cottin (1770–1807), France has never been a monolithic culture: it was precisely in the establishment's partial acknowledgment of women's intelligence and sexual self-determination that the conflict lay for many female authors.